

BISMILLAAHIR RAHMAANIR RAHEEM

WA SALLALLAAHO A'LAA WALIYYAL A'SRE (A.T.F.S.) ADRIKNAA

Caliphate is nothing but Succession of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)

Qualifications of the Position

If there exists a vacancy for a post in any college or university, then it is not just the position which is called out but its qualifications and criteria are also specified. If the vacancy is in the Department of History, then experts of the subject and those who have completed a formal education in it will be required. A scientist will take up a position in the Department of Science. He cannot occupy the position of a history professor. Hence, apart from the position, the credentials and qualifications are also specified well in advance. A scientist's application for the post of a Professor of History will be rejected by the selection committee. Only eligible candidates, who fit the criteria, will be interviewed. If a scientist actually occupies the position of a Professor of History or vice versa, then we can all image the state of the university.

Responsibilities of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)

Prior to appointing anyone as a successor to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) it is critical to understand the various responsibilities of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.). Selecting an appropriate person for this position completely depends on how well are the responsibilities understood.

The Holy Quran has outlined the duties of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), a few of them being:

1. Conveying the Revelation

The Holy Quran declares in the second verse of Surah Jum'a (62):

"He it is Who raised among the inhabitants of Mecca an Apostle from among themselves, who recites to them His communications and purifies them, and teaches them the Book and the Wisdom, although they were before certainly in clear error."

Allah the High sent for the people of the 'chief of towns' a Messenger from among themselves who would:

- a. Recite for them the Divine Communications
- b. Purify their souls
- c. Teach them the knowledge of the Book and Wisdom

Although the people were in manifest error prior to this! Divine communications refers to the verses of the Holy Quran which Allah had revealed for the guidance of people. The responsibility here was to convey Allah's Message to them by reciting those verses.

Infallibility – A Prerequisite

Infallibility was essential in order to convey the divine verses fittingly. If a Prophet or a Messenger

is fallible and even if there is a slightest possibility of any error or forgetfulness then the message would lose its credibility. There would be lingering doubts - what is the guarantee that the message is complete or that there are no additions or deletions to it? If there is no credibility then the purpose of sending the message will be nullified. Hence, in order to convey the verses appropriately, a Prophet and a Messenger has to be infallible.

2. Teaching and narrating the revelation

Another important responsibility of the Noble Prophet (s.a.w.a.) which is mentioned in the verse of Surah Jum'a is **"and teaches them the Book and the Wisdom"**. It means that mere recitation of the verses is not sufficient. Rather, the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) also had to explain and elucidate their interpretation. Imparting knowledge of the entire Quran implies that the giver of knowledge should himself be completely well-versed with all its concepts. Since the Holy Quran contains the knowledge of all moist and dry things and it explains everything clearly, the knowledge of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) should encompass all of it. Rather, the one who knows more than the book will only be able to explain everything from it eloquently. His recitation of the Holy Quran itself proves that the Almighty Allah had revealed much more upon the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). It is mentioned in verse 44 of Surah Nahl (16):

"...and We have revealed to you the Reminder that you may make clear to men what has been revealed to them"

It means that Allah the High revealed the

'Reminder' (Zikr) separately upon the Messenger (s.a.w.a.) in order to explain the revealed message.

The Holy Quran only contains the general principles. The details were clarified by the Noble Messenger (s.a.w.a.). The Noble Quran talks about prayers, fasting, pilgrimage, etc. but the specifics like the rules of prayers, pre-conditions, Azaan, Iqamah among others, were clarified by the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). Perhaps Allah the Almighty established this system so that the people don't become independent of the messengers. Since the Holy Quran is an eternal message and it is to last forever, the need for Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) or someone like him will always exist in order to expound its concepts.

Infallibility in order to explain the Holy Quran

Just as infallibility is necessary to convey the verses of the Holy Quran, it is also important while teaching and expounding the verses. Before getting into details it is important to understand that the message of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) in relation to the explanation of Quran is not like that of the exegetists (mufasssirreen). The scholarly and minute interpretations of all the mufasssirreen of the Noble Quran are limited to their knowledge and understanding of the Quran. None of them claim that their interpretation is the most accurate version of what Allah intended to convey and other interpretations must be rejected.

Whereas, every narration of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) about the Quran is the clarification of Allah's aim i.e. it is Allah's

message in the words of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.). Hence, along with the Quran, the words of the Messenger (s.a.w.a.) are also a binding proof.

Hence, it becomes evident that even while narrating any tradition a Prophet should intend to convey Allah's aim behind it and as a result he should be infallible else there would always be a possibility that Allah's objective and the Prophet's words might be incompatible. Every word of the Prophet, therefore, is an interpretation of Allah's wish.

3. Mastership in the Legislative World

The Almighty Allah raised the Noble Messenger (s.a.w.a.) as a "Master of Authority". The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) enjoys complete authority and mastership over the entire creation and every particle, from the depth of the earth to the highest point in the heavens, is subservient to his command. Simultaneously, Allah has made the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) an authority in the Shariah as well. It implies that the obedience to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is obligatory upon everyone unconditionally. Let us analyze a few verses of the Holy Quran under this discussion:

1. "And whatever the Messenger gives you, accept it, and from whatever he forbids you, keep back"

(Surah Hashr (59): 7)

Here the two parts **"And whatever the Messenger gives you"** and **"from whatever he forbids you"**, is a command and a prohibition respectively. Implying that it is necessary to do whatever the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) commands and to stay away from whatever he (s.a.w.a.)

prohibits. This verse highlights the absoluteness and unconditionally of the obedience to the Prophet's (s.a.w.a.) orders. No one has the right to question him.

2. "And it behoves not a believing man and a believing woman that they should have any choice in their matter when Allah and His Messenger have decided a matter; and whoever disobeys Allah and His Messenger, he surely strays off a manifest straying."

(Surah Ahzab (33): 36)

In this verse the words **"that they should have any choice"** rejects the possibility of any other option for a believer even in his personal affairs after Allah and the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) have taken a decision. He has absolutely no right to give his own opinion against that of Allah and the Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

Additionally the words **"when Allah and His Messenger have decided a matter"** emphasize that it can be any issue. The authority of Allah and His Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is not limited in any way and encompasses the entire life of a believer. Their authority extends to all aspects of one's life, be it personal, social, economical, worldly or religious.

"Allah and His Messenger". The unconditional mention of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) after the mention of Allah indicates the fact that in commands and prohibitions Allah has granted an independent status and authority to the personality of Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). Along with His own commands and prohibitions Allah has declared those of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) to be equally binding and compulsory. The orders of the Holy

Prophet (s.a.w.a.) thus have been given a distinct and independent status. Just as it is prohibited to disobey Allah, it is also prohibited to disobey him (s.a.w.a.).

It is clear that such authority is compatible only with infallibility. Just as the commands and prohibitions of Allah are free from error, fault or omission, so it is also true for the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

3. “The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has a greater claim on the faithful than they have on themselves”

(Surah Ahzab (33): 6)

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has more authority on a believer’s life, wealth and all his affairs than he himself. It is imperative for a believer to give precedence to the likes and dislikes of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) over his own likes and dislikes. The “greater claim” mentioned in this verse is generic in nature and does not refer to any peculiar situation.

4. “O you who believe! Obey Allah and obey the Messenger.”

(Surah Nisa (4): 59)

Even this verse makes a distinct mention of obedience to the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) along with obedience to Allah. The distinctness of the commands of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) from that of Allah is thus established. However it should be noted that this distinctness is granted by Allah. He has promulgated an independent obedience to the Prophet (s.a.w.a.). This is granted by Allah and does not contend with His authority. Hence if someone rejects this independent authority of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.), he is in fact rejecting the rights and authority granted by Allah Himself.

The Holy Quran only addresses the believers

In all these verses the addressee is the believer. Allah has trusted only a believer for obedience to the Prophet (s.a.w.a.), for submitting his own will to that of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and for giving precedence to the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) over his own wealth and life. Absolute obedience to the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is the sign of a true believer. If anyone denies his commands or even entertains a difference of opinion with him then according to the Holy Quran, **“he surely strays off a manifest straying.”**

Who will represent the Noble Prophet (s.a.w.a.)?

The responsibilities of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) are:

1. Promulgating the divine laws.
2. Teaching of knowledge and wisdom
3. Legal authority

The demise of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) formally ended the job of promulgating the divine laws. During his lifetime itself the religion was completed and there is no need to promulgate any new divine laws. Since religion was complete during the life of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), there is no situation of reciting verses or a new religious ruling but the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) himself performed these responsibilities. Apart from this, the explanation of the rulings and the teachings of the book and wisdom will remain till the Day of Judgement and the one who has the knowledge of the book and wisdom will only be eligible for this responsibility.

Now the question is – who should be the successor of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.)?

The answer is clear. Only that person can be the successor of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) who has the complete knowledge of the Quran like the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and teaches the book and wisdom like him (s.a.w.a.). Whose knowledge is divinely gifted like the prophet (s.a.w.a.) and has not sought knowledge in this world rather the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has taught him on the order of God.

The Propagation of Surah-e-Baraat

The initial verses of Surah-e-Baraat in which Allah had addressed the polytheists and expressed His and the Prophet's (s.a.w.a.) dislike for them needed to be recited in their midst in Mecca. The dislike for the polytheists needed to be expressed in their own centre and stronghold.

Sunni scholars have narrated this incident from Abdullah b. Umar as follows:

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) sent Abu Bakr and Umar to Mecca but the letter with the verses written on it was handed to Abu Bakr. Both took the letter and left for Mecca. They had not gone far when they saw a person approaching them on a camel. On asking, the person replied – I am Ali and O Abu Bakr, give me the letter. Abu Bakr asked if there was any development. Ali (a.s.) replied - I am not aware about it. Ali (a.s.) took the letter from them and went to Mecca. Umar and Abu Bakr returned to Medina and asked the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), “Was anything special revealed concerning us. Did any incident take place”? The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) replied in the negative but said that

“I have been told that none can deliver these verses from your side except either you or someone from you”

(Mustadrak al-Saheehain of Haakim Nishapuri vol. 3 p. 51)

Other Sunni scholars have narrated this incident quoting Ali (a.s.) in which it is clear that someone has informed the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) to replace Abu Bakr.

‘When Abu Bakr and Umar asked the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that whether there was anything revealed about us regarding this, he (s.a.w.a.) said, ‘No, but Jibrail informed me - No one can deliver this message except you or someone from you’

(Musnad-o-Ahmad vol. 1 p. 101, Sunan Tirmizi vol. 4 p. 339, Allama Amini (r.a.) has mentioned this incident in Al-Ghadeer vol. 6 p. 338-350 from 70 Sunni scholars)

It is evident from this incident that among the responsibilities of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) was recitation and propagation of Quranic verses and none can be his successor in this except Ali (a.s.). Moreover withdrawing this responsibility from other companions is also a clear sign in the matter of caliphate for those who understand.

Teaching and Explanation of Revelation

In the 43rd verse of Surah-e-Raad (13), Allah says,

“Those who disbelieved say that you are not a prophet. Say, indeed Allah is enough as witness between you and me and the one who has the knowledge of the book.”

This fact has also been pointed at in Surah-e-Hud, verse 17 that this witness is from the Prophet's (s.a.w.a.) family.

The verse reads:

“One who has a clear proof from the side of his Lord and the one who has a witness from himself.”

It has already been mentioned that the witness is from his own family and from himself.

The message which Archangel Jibrail (a.s.) delivered with regards to the propagation of the verse of Surah-e-Baraat was that either you yourself perform this duty or someone from you. History is witness that **“someone from you”** implies Ali (a.s.) and also **“witness from himself”** refers to Ali (a.s.) because the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said, *“Surely Ali is from me and I am from Ali”*. Therefore the witness referred to Surah-e-Ra’d who has the knowledge of the entire book is none other than Ali (a.s.). Following are two more traditions regarding the same:

1. Abu Saeed al-Khudri narrates that I asked the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that who does the verse **“And the one who has the knowledge of the Book”** refer to. He (s.a.w.a.) replied, *“He is my brother Ali b. Abi Talib”*

(Shawaahid al-Tanzeel of Haakim al-Haskaani, vol. 1 p. 40 Tr. 422, Yanaabi al-Mawaddah vol. 1 p. 307 chap 30 Tr. 7)

2. A renowned Sunni scholar, interpreter and historian Jalaaluddeen Suyuti records the following tradition in his famous exegesis Al-Durr Al-Manthoor vol. 3 p. 324 under the interpretation of Surah-e-Hud, verse 17:

Ibne Abi Haatim, Ibne Mardviyyah and Abu Nuaim have narrated from Ali (a.s.) in Al-Maarifah. He (a.s.) says, “There are

verses revealed regarding every man from the Quraish” One person asked, “Which verse is revealed regarding you?” He (a.s.) replied, “Have you not read Surah-e-Hud? – ‘Is he then who has with him clear proof from his Lord, and a witness from Him recites it’. According to the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) witness refers to me.

Hence it become absolutely clear that that one who has the knowledge of the entire book i.e. the knowledge of the entire Quran, the knowledge of the entire universe and the knowledge of the first and the last, is none other than Ali (a.s.). And apart from this, we have the tradition of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) which is famous and authentic:

1. *“I am the city of knowledge and Ali is it’s gate”*

(Behaar al-Anwaar, vol. 40 p. 201 Tr. 4)

2. In another tradition, Ali (a.s.) says, *“O people, ask me about whatever you want before you are deprived of me. This is the saliva of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he has fed me.”*

(Tauheed-e-Sadooq p. 298)

3. Imam Sadiq (a.s.) says in a tradition, *“The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) taught Ali (a.s.) a letter through which a thousand letters were opened and from them another thousand letters.”*

(Behaar al-Anwaar vol. 26 p. 30 Tr. 39)

Now it is extremely clear that only Ali (a.s.) can replace the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) in the teaching and explanation of revelation. In the entire Muslim nation, there is none who has more knowledge of the Book than Ali (a.s.),

Continued on page 12

Amr-e-Aas's poetry on Ameerul Momineen's (a.s.) virtues

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) had been regularly announcing the successorship and leadership of Ameerul Momineen Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.) right from the commencement of Islam. This chain of announcement concluded during the Hajjah al-Wida, while returning from Mecca to Medina, at a place called Johfah. The entire incident is well-documented in Islamic history as also the exegesis of Quran.

Our aim over here is not to analyze the innumerable merits and excellence and of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.). We only wish to advance a poetry penned by a staunch enemy of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.), Amr b. Aas, wherein he has condemned Muawiyah and praised Ali (a.s.) and addressed him as 'Imam al-Hoda' (Imam of guidance).

A noteworthy point over here is that while the friends and lovers of Ali (a.s.) have eulogized him through poetry, even his staunchest enemies have been just as active in promoting their art of poetry and have testified to the superiority and authority (wilayat) of Ali (a.s.) in verse.

Amr b. Aas – a proficient poet – penned a poem that is better known as 'Qasida-e-Juljuliyyah'. The Arabs consider this poetry among the masterpieces. It is full of praise for Ali (a.s.). Amr b. Aas has penned 66 verses in this poetry.

The renowned scholar Abdul Husain Amini (r.a.), better known as Allamah Amini, in his

invaluable book 'Al Ghadeer fi al-Kitaab wa al-Sunnah wa al-Adab', has documented the entire poem along with his notes.

Muawiyah's letter to Amr b. Aas

When Amr b. Aas did not send the tributes/taxes of Egypt, Muawiyah b. Abu Sufyan, demanded the same from him in a letter thus: 'I have raised the matter of the tributes of Egypt time and again, but you have not complied; on the contrary you have been defiant. This is my last letter to you on the subject. Submit the tributes of Egypt immediately, without any delay. Wassalam'

Amr b. Aas's rejoinder

Taking exception to the tone of the letter, Amr b. Aas replied in verse condemning Muawiyah and reminding him of the instances when they both conspired to keep the caliphate away from Ali (a.s.). He goes on to highlight the truthfulness and merits of Ali (a.s.) and acknowledges him as 'Imam al-Hoda.'

Qasida-e-Juljuliyyah

The last word of this panegyric poem (Qasida) is Juljuliyyah from which it derives its name. Juljuliyyah means bell or jingle.

Every verse of this poem is a resounding slap in Muawiyah's face. Our purpose is not to offer a literal word by word translation of the entire poem. Rather we wish to expose the cunningness and scheming nature of

Muawiyah and Amr b. Aas so that Muslims are aware of their dirty politics. To that end, we present a gist of the poem to give an idea.

For the purpose of translation we have relied on the Persian translation (volume 3) of 'Al-Ghadeer'. We have drawn from the Persian rhymed version of the poem that has been endorsed by 106 poets as analysed by Muhammed Taqi Wahidi.

(al-Ghadeer, vol. 3, p. 207)

Meaning of Qasida-e-Juljuliyyah

1. O Muawiyah do not feign innocence about our plan, nor be a step away from the straight path
2. Have you forgotten the day when you became a leader and how I had cheated the people of Syria
3. How the people came to you in flocks and started wailing and complaining to you as meek cows
4. Have you forgotten that I told them that their obligatory prayers would not be accepted without accepting Muawiyah
5. And was the reason that they left their religion and obligatory prayers and got ready to fight in war with you
6. Remember the day, when you turned away from 'Imam al-Hoda' despite the fact that his army comprised of brave and courageous soldiers
7. (You had said), should I wage a war along with the people of piety along with these cheaters and evil people who are as silent cows?
8. I said: Yes, rise against them; as I will see a war between the better and the best
9. Hence, due to me these people fought

with the chief of successors Ali (a.s.) to avenge the death of Usman

10. I instigated your soldiers to raise the pages of Quran on spears
11. I had taught your soldiers to expose their private parts so that their enemy will not kill them and avert their eyes

(In the battle of Siffeen, Amr b. Aas was once confronted by Ali (a.s.) and when he realized death was upon him, to save his life, he threw himself on the ground and exposed his private parts. This action saved his life (Sharh-e-Nahjul Balaghah of Ibne Abil Hadeed vol 2 pg 110). A similar modus operandi was adopted by the 'brave general and raider' Busr b. Artaat in the same battle.)

12. After which the rebels rose against Haider and kept the people away from guidance
13. Have you forgotten how I had conversed with Abu Musa Ashari in 'Dumah al Jandal'.

(After the battle of Siffeen, Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) went to Kufa and from there sent Abu Moosa Ashari under the leadership of Shareeh b. Haani along with 400 people to Dumah al Jandal and sent Abdullah b. Abbas along with them as Imam of the congregation. At this point, Muawiyah sent Amr b. Aas to Dumah al Jandal. After reaching there Amr b. Aas did not meet Abu Moosa for three days and then with a lot of planning met him and embellished him with different titles which fooled Abu Moosa. He asked Amr b. Aas: What is your view about the correct way for the reformation of the Muslims? Amr b. Aas answered: You denounce the caliphate of Ali (a.s.) and I do the same with Muawiyah. We

will select Abdullah b. Umar who has not been involved in any conspiracy and corruption so far, nor has he been involved in any bloodshed. The promises made by Amr b. Aas, convinced Abu Moosa. Amr b. Aas deceived him with his cunningness and convinced Abu Moosa to initiate the proceeding and when Abu Moosa got the title of 'Samiri of Iraqis', he said: O people! After a lot of thinking and consultation and for the reformation of the people and their guidance, and to further avoid bloodshed we have removed a way out of this situation and it is this that I denounce the caliphate of Ali (a.s.) and Amr b. Aas will denounce the caliphate of Muawiyah. I have set aside the caliphate of Ali (a.s.) in the same way as I set aside my turban (and he removed his turban) and we select such a person as caliph who himself is a companion of the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) just like his father and he is Abdullah b. Umar. (Manaqib-e-Shahre Ashoob vol 3 pg 185). Then Amr ibn Aas rose and said: O people! Certainly Abu Moosa has denounced the caliphate of Ali (a.s.) and he is a wise person with regards to Ali (a.s.), know that even I have denounced the caliphate of Ali (a.s.) and appoint Muawiyah as your and my caliph.

When Abu Moosa realized he had been duped he turned on Amr b. Aas and showered him with abuses. Amr b. Aas retaliated in the same coin. They turned the arbitration into a joke and it became the cause of much corruption and dissent in society.

14. I speak in a way that turns a person greedy and he is deceived by my cunningness

15. I removed Haider from caliphate as effortlessly as we remove shoes from our feet
16. I made you wear the ring of leadership when you had lost all hopes of leading
17. I made you sit on the pulpit of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) without waging a war
18. (While) you were not capable of this position
19. I banished the hypocrite soldiers of Iraq, due to which you could conquer the east and west
20. It was I who spread your name in areas far and wide.
21. O the son of Hinda (the liver eater) (Muawiyah)! If you do not recognize me then this is very good for me
22. Had I not been your advisor then people would have never obeyed you nor would they ever accept you
23. Had I not been there, you would be sitting in the house like women and would never leave the house
24. O son of Hinda! I assisted you against the Great News and the Best of Creation (Ali (a.s.)) on account of my ignorance and innocence
25. And when I made you the chief of the people, we fell to depths of lowliness and plunged to lowest of the low
26. Despite the fact that we had heard numerous merits and virtues about Ali (a.s.) from Muhammed Mustafa (s.a.w.a.)

Acknowledging the announcement of Ghadeer

27. On the day of Ghadeer when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) ascended the pulpit

and informed the people about Allah's order, none of the caravans had reached their homes

28. He (s.a.w.a.) placed the hand of Ali (a.s.) in his own hand and informed the people about the order of Allah
29. O people! Do I not have more authority over you than you have over yourselves; and don't I have the authority of Wilayat over you?

All answered: Yes O Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.), you do as you please.

30. Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), by the command of Allah, handed over the caliphate to Ali (a.s.) and mentioned that he can delegate caliphate to whomsoever he wishes.
31. He (s.a.w.a.) said: *Of whomsoever I am a Master, this Ali is also his Master.*
32. Then he (s.a.w.a.) prayed: *Befriend his friends and keep the enemies of the brother of your Prophet as his enemies.*
33. *O people! Do not ever break the oath that you have taken for my family, because the one who breaks this allegiance will not be able to reach to me on the Day of Resurrection.*
34. On seeing that this allegiance has become very strong and could not be altered, your chiefs (Abu Bakr and Umar) congratulated Ali (a.s.), through the words 'bakhin bakhin' (congratulations).
35. Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said: *Ali is your Master, protecting him is your duty and behave with him as you behaved with me*

Amr b. Aas considered himself and Muawiyah as dwellers of hell

36. We, on account of our deeds will go to

the lowest degree of hell

37. The blood of Usman will not give us relief on the Day of Resurrection, but it will be a Day of Embarrassment for us.
38. On the Day of Resurrection, Ali (a.s.) through the medium of Allah and His Messenger (s.a.w.a.) will be in a position of great respect and honor and we will be his enemies
39. Allah will take into accounting all the misdeeds and we will be at the receiving end far from truth and will be with falsehood
40. The hidden truth will be unveiled and there will be no excuse on that Day. Woe unto us, what will happen to us on that Day?
41. O son of Hinda (Muawiyah)! Beware about the promise you made me and you did not act accordingly, by this you have sold your paradise
42. In order to gain some materialistic benefit of the world you have left numerous bounties of paradise and forfeited the hereafter
43. You have gathered people around you and caliphate is ready for you, what is the use of such a caliphate that has come to you through others?
44. You are likened to a hunter who has thrown a net to deceive people and keeps thirsty people away from water

Accepting defeat at Siffeen

45. Have you forgotten the dreadful night of 'Lailah al-Hareer' in the war of Siffeen
46. On that day, due to fear of brave and courageous men you had become very

- weak and akin to an ostrich you even soiled your pants
47. When you saw your weak army, you were frightened as if a hungry lion is ready to destroy you
48. You were engulfed in a lot of difficulty to such an extent that a vast place seemed small to you
49. You called out to me – ‘O Amr where is the escape from powerful warriors?’
50. ‘There is no other way out. You must work out another strategy against their strikes. Make a way out as my heart is very uneasy.’
51. When your caliphate was not yet established, you had promised to give me half of whatever you achieved in victory
52. I also hurried to help you and unclothed myself and exposed myself in front of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.)
53. Due to his modesty he covered his face and did not kill me. This is such a plan which you could have never thought of on your own
54. But you shivered like a moth out of fear of the brave and courageous men
55. But when you established your government and took over the reins in your hand;
56. You bestowed others with wealth and property but did not give me a single penny
57. You gave the rulership of Egypt to Abdul Malik and did injustice to me
58. Though you desire the government of Egypt but now its reins are in my hand, hence you must now realize that the hen

who ate stones, has escaped from the clutches of the vulture and the reins of the government are slipping from your hands

59. Either forget about the government of Egypt and excuse me from paying the tribute of Egypt or be prepared to fight me as I will wage a war against you and strike fear inside you
60. I am waiting for you with a well-equipped army
61. I will destroy your ego completely and those people/ children who have become orphans because of you I will make them aware about you and also make them rise against you

Amr b. Aas ticks off Muawiyah – you are not Ameerul Momineen

62. You are far from being eligible to govern the people
63. Neither you nor your forefathers have any right to caliphate
64. O Muawiyah! Can there be any similarity between you and Ali (a.s.)? Ali (a.s.) is like a sharp sword and you are like a blunt rusted one
65. Ali (a.s.) is a shining star of the sky. There can be no comparison between you and him. You are nothing but dust.
66. If you have succeeded in governing and attained your desire, it is only because of my efforts

Conclusion

There can be an independent essay on each of these 66 verses. In this letter Amr b. Aas has exposed all the scheming and plotting

done by Muawiyah with his help against Ali (a.s.). It is unfortunate that many Muslims despite knowing the reality are silent on the matter.

References

This poem has been mentioned in the following books:

1. Its two phrases have been independently published and are also present in the library of Egypt. The books in the library run into many volumes and are listed for reference. The two phrases can be accessed in vol 4, pg 314 of the list.
2. Ibne Abil Hadeed has mentioned some of the phrases in Sharh-e-Nahjul Balaghah in vol 2, pg 544. He has come across them in the book of Abu Zakariyya Yahya b. Ali

Khateeb Tabrezi (exp. 502 AH)

3. Shaikh Muhammed Azhari in the commentary on 'Mughni al-Labeeb' vol 1, pg 82 has narrated the entire poem from 'Tarikh Ishaaq'.
4. Zanzuri has narrated the entire poem in 'Riyaz al-Jannah' part 2

The adversaries can never hide the truth, no matter how much they try. 'They desire to put out the light of Allah with their mouths but Allah will perfect His light, though the unbelievers may be averse'. (Surah Saff (61): 8). Soon there will come a time when the successor of Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.), the 12th Imam – Imam Mahdi (a.t.f.s.) reappears and take to task those who hid the virtues of Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.).

Continued from page 6

rather he (a.s.) is more knowledgeable than anyone else in any type of knowledge.

If caliphate is the succession of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), and successorship demands the successor to possess certain characteristics, then only Ali (a.s.) possesses those characteristics.

Succession in the world of actions (tashree'i)

When the succession of Ali (a.s.) is established in the propagation, teaching and explanation of the revelation, then even in the world of actions, he (a.s.) is the successor. The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) announced this on 18th Zilhajj before a huge gathering of companions in the plains of Ghadeer thus -

"Of whomsoever I am the master this

Ali is his master."

That is, he bears the same right of rule and sovereignty just as me and has more authority on yourselves than you yourselves do. My obedience is obligatory upon everyone and opposing me is forbidden. And all these things are applicable for Ali (a.s.) after me.

To summarise, if caliphate is the succession of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), then Ali (a.s.) possesses all the characteristics of a successor and only he (a.s.) is the successor of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.). And if caliphate is someone else's succession, then we have nothing to do with it.

'And nothing devolves on us but a clear deliverance (of the message).'

Analysis of the 'Tradition of Light' (Hadis-e-Nur)

Hadis-e-Nur i.e. the 'Tradition of Light' has been recorded and chronicled extensively and consecutively, with minor variations, by both Sunni and Shia scholars in their reliable books, who have advanced it as evidence of the superiority and excellence of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and his infallible progeny (a.s.). Notwithstanding the authenticity and extensive narration of this tradition, the skeptics and antagonists of religion have attempted to cast doubts and aspersions on its content and chain of narrators.

One of the important conclusions of this tradition is that Ameerul Momineen Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.) is the Caliph and the Imam of the Muslims immediately after the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.), a message which the enemies and skeptics have tried to conceal or at the very least cast aspersion on with a view to mask the truth. In order to dispel such baseless doubts and suspicions, we will discuss this tradition in a series of articles and throw light on the following aspects of this tradition:

1. Hadis-e-Nur: An Introduction
2. Its chain of narrators
3. The Sahaabah i.e. companions who narrated the tradition
4. The Taabe'een i.e. second generation companions (who did not see the Prophet s.a.w.a.) who have narrated

the tradition

5. The Huffaaz i.e. memorizers of the Quran who narrated the tradition
6. The authenticity of Hadis-e-Nur
7. The reliability of scholars who narrated Hadis-e-Nur
8. Answers to objections of the skeptics
9. Other merits of Aal-e-Muhammad (a.s.)

Hadis-e-Nur – An Introduction

Hadis-e-Nur has been extensively narrated by the scholars of both the sects. We present hereunder its common variants, with a common message underpinning all of them.

The Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:

I and Ali b. Abi Talib both were a light (Nur) in the presence of Allah fourteen thousand years before the creation of Adam. When Allah created Adam, he deposited this light in Adam's loins. We remained together as one light until we were separated in Abdul Muttalib's loin. Thereafter, I was endowed with Prophethood and Ali with Caliphate.

Among others, the following Sunni scholars have documented Hadis-e-Nur:

- Imam Ahmad b. Hanbal in his Musnad
- Mir Sayyed Ali Hamdani in Mawaddah al-Qurbah
- Ibn Maghaazili Shaafe'i in his Manaaqib

- Muhammad b. Talhah Shaafe'i in Mataalib al-So'l fi Manaagib-e-Aal-e-Rasool
- Ibrahim b. Muhammad Hamweeni Shaafe'ei in Faraaid al-Simtain fi Fazaail al-Murtuza wa al-Batool wa al-Sibtain
- Khaarazmi in his al-Manaaqib
- Abd al-Hameed Ibn Abil Hadeed in Sharh-o-Nahj al-Balaaghah
- Haafiz Sulaimaan Qundoozi in Yanabee al-Mawaddah

The aforementioned as also several other Sunni scholars are unanimous about the authenticity of this tradition, which is a separate topic of discussion.

Shia version of Hadis-e-Nur

While the tradition has been widely reported by both sects, Shia reports are more detailed and hence offer greater insight into the excellence of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and his immaculate progeny (a.s.).

For the sake of brevity, we have not delved into the Shia sources of the tradition since it is transmitted consecutively through several reliable chains of narrators (tawaatur) and the authenticity of the tradition is not debatable for the Shias.

Abdullah b. Abbas narrates from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.):

Allah created me and Ali from a light (Nur) below the Throne (Arsh) 12,000 years before the creation of Adam. When Allah created Adam, He placed this light in his loin and it transferred from one loin to another till it reached Abdul Muttalib after which it was divided in two parts.

Maaz b. Jabal narrates from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.):

Certainly Allah created me, Ali, Fatima, Hasan and Husain seven thousand years before creating this world.

Maaz b. Jabal asked:

O Messenger of Allah, where were you then?

He (s.a.w.a.) replied:

We were under the throne glorifying, extolling and purifying Allah (from defects).

Maaz asked:

In what form and shape were you all at that time?

He (s.a.w.a.) replied:

We were in the form of lights. When Allah wished to give us a shape, He placed us in the form of a pillar of light in the loin of Adam (a.s.). He then transferred this Nur from the loins to the wombs. He always kept us purified from filth, polytheism and adultery which were widespread in the period of disbelief. In every era, certain groups of people attained felicity on account of believing in us and several others were unfortunate on account of rejecting us. When He brought us in the loin of Abdul Muttalib, He divided it into two parts and placed one half in the loin of Abdullah (a.s.) and the other part in that of Abu Talib (a.s.). Thereafter, my light was transferred to (my mother) Aaminah and the other half to (Ali's mother)

Fatima binte Asad. I was born from Aaminah and Ali was born from Fatima binte Asad. Then, the light reverted to me and my daughter Fatima was born. Likewise, the light was reverted to Ali, and Hasan and Husain were born from both parts of the light i.e. light of Ali and Fatima. Thus, my light found its way in the Imams from the progeny of Husain till the Day of Judgment.

From the above tradition, we understand among other points that Ameerul Momeneen's (a.s.) light is from the light of the Noble Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and in matters of guidance and leadership, he (a.s.) shares the same status as that of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) except that he is the Imam and Caliph, and not a Prophet, which is also the case with the Imams in his progeny. Just like the position and stature of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) cannot be denied and denying it would amount to apostasy, skepticism about the position of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) as the Imam and Caliph of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) is apostasy.

Also this tradition redeems all the ancestors of Prophet Muhammad (s.a.w.a.) and Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) of apostasy and hypocrisy. This includes the oft-targeted personalities like Hazrat Abu Talib (a.s.), Hazrat Abdullah (a.s.), Hazrat Aaminah (s.a.) who are incessantly and unfairly accused of disbelief while the Tradition of Light proclaims them as the perfect believers untainted even by the

shadow of apostasy.

Another report states:

Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) informed:
When Adam (a.s.) was created, this light was placed in his loin. When he was in the heavens, he carried this light with him. When Nuh (a.s.) embarked on the ark this light was in his back. When Ibrahim (a.s.) was thrown in the fire, he carried this light inside him. This light was transferred from pure loins to chaste wombs till it reached Hazrat Abdul Muttalib (a.s.). It was then divided into two parts. I was bestowed with Prophethood and Ali with Imamat.

Thus, this light was the cause of safety for Divine Prophets and Messengers of Allah (peace be on them all) from various examinations.

There are also several verses in the Holy Quran that point out to the sanctity of this light. We quote one of them.

A man asked the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) about the following verse of Holy Quran:

He said: O Iblis what has prevented you from prostrating before the one whom I created with my hands, are you being proud or have you become of the elevated ones?

(Surah Suad (38): Verse 75)

The man asked – Who are these creatures who are more elevated than the angels?

He (s.a.w.a.) replied:

They are I, Ali, Fatima, Hasan and

Husain. We were extolling and praising Allah. The angels praised and glorified Allah after they heard us praising and glorifying Allah... Then Allah ordered the angels to prostrate before Adam. All of them obeyed His command except Iblis. Then Allah reprimanded him: You have acted with pride with respect to my command of prostration. Have you become one of those elevated people whose names are written on the throne?

(Tafseer-e-Burhaan by Sayyid Haashim Bahraani (r.a.), vol. 4, p. 684 from Fadhaael al-Shiah by Shaikh Sadooq (r.a.) who has recorded on the authority of Abu Saeed Khudri from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.))

It has been narrated from Imam Hasan (a.s.) that Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said:
I have been created from the light of Allah and my Ahle Bait (a.s.) have been created from my light and the lovers of Ahle Bait (a.s.) have been created from their light. All people besides them are (created) from the fire of hell.

In summary, the 'Tradition of Light' (Hadis-e-Nur) brings to the fore, amongst numerous other excellences, the following virtues of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and his infallible progeny (a.s.):

- They were the first creation of Allah i.e. they were created when none other than Allah existed before them.
- Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and his progeny belong to a lineage where all ancestors (including Abu Talib (a.s.), Abdullah

(a.s.), Hazrat Aaminah (s.a.)) up to Hazrat Adam (a.s.) have been monotheists and have never fallen in the abyss of polytheism and related vices.

- Those who submitted to the leadership of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and his progeny (a.s.) attained felicity both in this world and the hereafter while those who opposed them fell in the abyss of disbelief and degradation in this world and the hereafter
- They were the ones exempted from prostrating before Adam (a.s.)
- The angels learnt glorification (Tasbeeh) and praise (Hamd) of Allah from the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and his progeny (a.s.)
- Only those created from this light will attain salvation while all others are doomed

Interested readers may refer to the famous book Abaqaat al-Anwaar, penned by the great Mir Haamid Husain al-Kinturi al-Hindi (r.a.), which contains a comprehensive list of Sunni scholars who have recorded this tradition. For the information of the readers, the aforementioned book is a rebuttal to Tohfa-e-Isnaa Ashari written by Muhaddis Dehlavi.

Is Abu Bakr worthy of caliphate because he led the prayers? Ibne Taymiyyah's view

Muslims believe they have some 'strong' proofs why Abu Bakr was worthy of being the caliph after the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). One of these involves the Holy Prophet's (s.a.w.a.) so-called order for Abu Bakr to lead the prayers.

According to the Muslims, such an 'order' makes Abu Bakr superior to the Muslims and worthy of leading the nation after the Prophet (s.a.w.a.).

Reply

We will prove that the position of Imamah in leading the prayers cannot be a proof for being the Noble Prophet's (s.a.w.a.) successor.

First and foremost, the scholars of Ahle Tassanun rely on fabricated traditions to prove the so-called command to lead the prayers. This so-called tradition does not have a reliable chain of narrators in their books.

Even if we assume as correct the order of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) to Abu Bakr for leading the prayers in his (s.a.w.a.) stead, this tradition cannot be a proof for the greater Imamah and the successorship. This is because when the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) went out of Medina, he always appointed someone for leading the prayers for the people in his (s.a.w.a.) place. Among them – as the scholars have narrated – on one such occasion he appointed the blind Ibne Umm Maktoom for leading prayers in his (s.a.w.a.) place.

Regarding this tradition, Abu Dawood has a chapter in his Sunan vol. 1 p. 203 under the

Book of Prayers – Chapter of Imamah of the Blind.

Under the chapter Abu Dawood records:

Abu Abdillah Muhammed b. Abdul Rahman Ambari narrated from Ibn Mahdi and he from Imran Qattan and he from Qataadah from Anas who said: Prophet (s.a.w.a.) made the blind Ibn Umm Maktoom as his successor for leading the Muslims in prayers.

Does any Muslim believe in the Imamah and caliphate of Ibn Umm Maktoom on the ground that the Noble Prophet (s.a.w.a.) appointed him as his successor for leading the prayers?!

This is so clear that even Ibne Taymiyyah – who is called Shaikhul Islam by the Salafis – has acknowledged this and he records in his book Minhaaj al-Sunnah vol. 7 p. 339:

'Appointing a successor during the lifetime is considered as a kind of representation, which is an inescapable affair for every authoritative person (Wali). It does not mean that everyone who was appointed as Wali-e-Amr during the lifetime of the person has the capability for successorship on some of the affairs of the nation and on the death of the person he also has the capability to remain his (Wali-e-Amr) successor. This is because the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) during his lifetime has made more than one person as his successor and among them no one was having the capability of successorship after the death of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) just as Prophet (s.a.w.a.)

Continued on page 22

When Allah the All-Knowing closed the door on Abu Bakr

For some Muslims, guidance means to spread lies, misinformation and creating differences within the community. One of their attempts is aimed at transferring virtues from one individual to another based on some fabricated reports and traditions. One such virtue relates to closing the doors of the Mosque of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) for all companions save one.

It is surprising to find Muslims groping for answers to the identity of the companion, when the matter is already settled in favour of the chosen companion – Ameerul Momineen Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.) as the only one along with the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) whose door was allowed to be opened into Masjid al-Nabawi (s.a.w.a.).

Argument of the skeptics

First let us examine the tradition introduced by these Muslims to support their claim regarding Abu Bakr.

Zaid b. Arqam states - Allah's Apostle (s.a.w.a.) addressed the people saying - Allah has given option to a slave to choose this world or what is with Him. The slave has chosen what is with Allah.

Abu Bakr wept and we were astonished at his weeping caused by what the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) mentioned as to a slave (of Allah) who had been offered a choice, (we learned later on) that Allah's Apostle (s.a.w.a.) himself was the person who was given the choice, and that Abu Bakr knew best among all of us.

Allah's Apostle (s.a.w.a.) added – The

person who has favoured me most of all both with his company and wealth is Abu Bakr. If I were to take a Khalil (friend) other than my Lord, I would have taken Abu Bakr as such, but (what relates us) is the Islamic brotherhood and friendliness. All the gates of the Mosque should be closed except the gate of Abu Bakr.

(Sahih al-Bukhari, vol. 5, Book 57, No. 6)

Reply

The only response we can give to such sham reports is by advancing authentic reports that clearly disprove this virtue for Abu Bakr and reposit it in favour of its true owner – Ameerul Momineen Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.).

To make the matter more conclusive we begin by relating the traditions that Ibn Hajar al-Asqalani (exp. 852 A.H.) has documented in his Sharh of Sahih-e-Bukhari - Fath al-Baari fi Sharh Sahih al-Bukhaari.

Ibn Hajar has rejected the tradition in Sahih-e-Bukhari favouring Abu Bakr and has advanced some traditions by way of example to prove this was for Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.).

Ibn Hajar records the following traditions favouring Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.):

Tradition No. 1

Zaid b. Arqam narrates - Some companions had a path through the mosques one day the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) said - Close all the doors except that of Ali.

Zaid says that people (the companions

whom we are told would accept any order of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) started speaking (against the order). Thus, the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) stood up and praised Allah and said - I have ordered to close all the doors except the door of Ali, by Allah! I have neither closed nor opened anything but I have been ordered to do so and I obeyed.

1. Musnad-o-Ahmad vol. 4, p. 329, tradition 19,502 – Imam Ahmed b. Hanbal is one of the four Sunni Imams of jurisprudence
2. Sunan-e-Kubra of Nesaai one of the authors of Sihah-e-Sittah (vol. 7, p. 422, tradition 8,369 & later edition vol. 5, p. 118, tradition 8,423)
3. Al Bidayah wa al-Nihayah of Ibn Kasir, vol. 5 p. 456 – he was a student of Ibn Taymiyyah who has rejected this tradition as a Shiite fabrication
4. Haakim in Mustadrak alaa al-Sahihain (vol. 3, p. 125, tradition 4,688) records that this report is with correct chain of narrators (Sahih al-sanad).
5. Zahabi in his Talkhees al-Mustadrak records that the report is Sahih
6. Fadhail al-Sahaabah vol. 2 p. 618-620/985
7. Majma al-Zawaaid vol. 9 p. 114 tradition 14,671
8. Riyaaz al-Nazarah vol. 4 p.136

Tradition No. 2

Saad b. Abi Waqqaas – The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) ordered all of us to close the doors excepting Ali (whose door was kept open).

This report has been narrated by Ahmad and Nesaai and its chain is strong. It is reported with chain of ‘siqah’ (reliable) narrators in Tabaraani’s Mojam al-Awsat. And there is

some addition to it - Companions said – “O Prophet! Have our doors been closed? Prophet (s.a.w.a.) clarified – I did not close anything but Allah closed them.

Tradition No. 3

Ibn Abbas narrates – The Prophet (s.a.w.a.) ordered to close all the doors (opening in the Mosque) except that of Ali (a.s.), and in another narration, it is that he ordered to close all the doors except that of Ali and Ali would enter the mosque though he be in state of janaabat and he had no other route.

This report is narrated by Ahmad and Nesaai and narrators of both are siqah (reliable).

Tradition No. 4

Jaabir b. Samurah narrates - Prophet (s.a.w.a.) ordered to close all the doors except that of Ali and he would come in the mosque, even when mujnib.

Tabaraani has narrated this report.

Abdullah b. Umar narrates we would say in the era of Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he (Ali) is the best and then Abu Bakr and Umar; Ali got three things had I got any of these, I would have loved them more than red camels:

1. Prophet (s.a.w.a.) gave him his daughter and progeny of Ali is from her
2. All the doors were closed except that of Ali and it opened in the mosque
3. He got the flag in Khaibar

This hadis is narrated by Imam Ahmad b. Hanbal and is reliable (hasan).

And Imam Nesaai differed in the chain of A’la b. A’arar- he said I asked Ibn Umar - tell me about Ali and Usman, so he narrated this

hadith - do not ask about Ali, his status was such near the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) that he closed all the doors except his door.

All narrators of this hadis are 'siqah' except A'laa. However, Yahya b. Moin and others did his tauseeq (considered him reliable).

Finally Ibn Hajar says - All these traditions strengthen each other (regarding Ali's door exempted from being closed), what to talk of whole collection.

In fact Hafiz Haisami (exp. 807 A.H.) compiled a chapter on this subject in Majma al-Zawaaid and has documented the traditions with several chains.

For instance, we share his analysis of just 3 reports of this chapter.

Tradition 14,671 – Imam Ahmed b. Hanbal has narrated the tradition and in his chain is Maimoon Abu Abdillah who is reliable according to Ibn Habbaan and rest considered him weak and other narrators in Ahmed's chain are correct (Saheeh).

Tradition 14,672 – Imam Ahmed b. Hanbal's chain is reliable (Hasan).

Tradition 14,678 – Al-Bazzaar has narrated it (in his Musnad) and his chain is reliable.

Muhammad Naasiruddin al-Albaani – the Salafi scholar has also documented this hadis in his analysis of Sunan-e-Tirmizi.

Regarding Abu Bakr's tradition in Sahih-e-Bukhari

Ibne Hajar has attempted to resolve the obvious contradiction in Sahih-e-Bukhari which mysteriously names Abu Bakr as the companion, while it is unanimous in the Sunnah that it is none other than Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.) whose door was permitted to be

opened along with that of the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) while doors of all companions were ordered to be closed.

Ibn Hajar records in Fath al-Baari:

... the command for closing the door was given twice. In the first command, only Ali was excused (while all companions had to close the doors), and in the second command Abu Bakr was excused. But this cannot be understood till the time we do not understand that Ali's door was original door and Abu Bakr's door was a supposed one and the door was 'al-Khookhah' as has been explained by other reports.

It seems that when all the doors were closed (except that of Ali) in the first command, the companions opened 'khookhaa' and would enter through that. Then there was a second command and these were also closed (except that of Abu Bakr) and there is no harm in combining the two reports in this manner.

Abu Jafar al-Tahaawi did this in 'Mushkil al-Asar' and Abu Bakr Kalabadi in 'Ma'ani al-Akhbaar' and they wrote categorically that Abu Bakr's main door opened out of mosque and 'al-Khookhah' inside and Ali's house only had one door which opened inside the mosque and Allah knows best.

What is al-Khookhah?

Qari Faizi writes in Sharh of Khasais-e-Ali, p. 245 under al-Khookhah:

Imam Nawawi writes - Khookhaa with fatha of kha is that small door which combined two rooms or houses

(Al-Minhaaj Fi Sharh-e-Sahih Muslim vol. 15, p. 147)

But overall, he has used the word window for khookhaa.

Where was Abu Bakr's house located?

All discussions on first door/second door/window is meaningless until we identify location of Abu Bakr's house. If reports are to be believed Abu Bakr did not live anywhere close to the Prophet's (s.a.w.a.) Mosque.

Tradition No. 1

(The wife of the Prophet narrates) Allah's Apostle (s.a.w.a.) died while Abu Bakr was at a place called Al-Sunah (Al-'Aliya)

(Sahih al-Bukhari, vol.5, Book 57, tradition19)

Tradition No. 2

Ibn Jurair al-Tabari in his Tarikh, vol. 3 p. 432 records:

Saeed b. Musayyab, Abdur-Rahman b. Sabeedah al-Tamimi from his father, Ibn Umar, Urwah from Aisha, Abi Wajizat from his father – and others apart from these. Some of their reports have been narrated to me (al-Tabari) while others have narrated from others among them. They have all said: The dwelling place of Abu Bakr was at Al-Sunah. He lived there with his wife Habibah, daughter of Kharijah b. Zayd b. Abu Zuhayr from the tribe of al-Haris b. al-Khazraj.

Tradition No. 3

Yaqut al-Hamawi in his Mo'jam al-Buldan vol 3 pg 760 writes:

Al-Sunah: It was on the outskirts of Medina. Abu Bakr's dwelling place was there.

Clearly Abu Bakr actually used to come to the Prophet's (s.a.w.a.) Mosque from his place at Al-Sunah, on the outskirts of Medina. How then could the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.) have commanded the companions to close their

front doors/backdoors/gates/windows into the Holy Prophet's Mosque except that of Abu Bakr?

In fact, Abu Bakr was not even the addressee of this command. The command was specifically addressed to those who were fortunate enough to live along the periphery of the Mosque.

Salafi view on the tradition

The Imam of the Salafis – Ibne Taymiyyah claims that the report of the closing of doors for all except Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.) is a fabrication of the Shias. We have already disproved this from several Sunni traditions. Salafis need to answer whether Abu Bakr's residence at Al-Sunah is also a Shiite fabrication?

However, many Salafi scholars have differed with Ibn Taymiyyah on this topic. Muhammad Naasiruddin al-Albani – the Salafi scholar documented this hadis in his analysis of Sunan-e-Tirmidhi.

Albani has likewise been critical of Ibn Taymiyyah's haste in rejecting Hadith-e-Ghadeer as a Shiite lie.

Did the house of Ameerul Momineen (a.s.) have a door?

Some Muslims in a bid to reject some other historical events like the felling of the door on Fatima (s.a.) resulting in the martyrdom of the third grandson martyr Mohsin b. Ali (a.s.) deny that a door ever existed. In our view, this view is even more foolish than the argument that the closing of the door was for all except Abu Bakr.

If Fatima's (s.a.) house did not have a door, how did Allah order the closing of all doors

except that of Ali!

Or how did the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) knock on the door of Fatima's (s.a.) house for nearly 9 months after the revelation of the verse of Tatheer (Surah Ahzaab (33): 33) at the time of the morning prayers to offer greetings to the Ahle Bait (a.s.)?

(Al-Ehtejaaj vol 2 pg 515)

Backdoor entry for Abu Bakr

It seems whenever Allah has closed all doors for Abu Bakr, his supporters created a backdoor entry for him. This is true with regards to this particular virtue as also caliphate. Time and again as testified by the most prejudiced of Sunni historians, Allah bestowed extraordinary virtues on Ali b. Abi Talib (a.s.) like closing of doors for all save Ali

(a.s.), granting of standard in Khaibar, propagation of Surah Baraat by explicitly turning back Abu Bakr, nomination in Ghadeer, to cite but a few drops from the boundless ocean of Ali's (a.s.) virtues. But despite these virtues, Abu Bakr's supporters after him have either summarily rejected these traditions or have fashioned a backdoor entry for Abu Bakr to justify his caliphate.

But when Allah has closed the door for someone, who can open it? And no tradition has closed the door on Abu Bakr as effectively as the tradition of closing of all doors save that of Ali (a.s.).

Continued from page 17

made the blind Ibn Umm Maktoom his successor during his lifetime, while he (Ibn Umm Maktoom) was not having the capability of successorship after the death of the Holy Prophet (s.a.w.a.). In the same way Bashir b. Abd al-Munzir and others (were also appointed).'

In fact, their narrators have even narrated that the Messenger of Allah (s.a.w.a.) prayed behind Abdul Rahman b. Auf (God forbid). If this tradition, by an impossible assumption is correct, it does not become a proof for Abdul Rahman b. Auf's successorship after the Prophet (s.a.w.a.) and because of this very reason no one has made such a claim.

It is clear that this tradition is false, because it is against a necessary and definite affair that Prophet (s.a.w.a.) has not prayed

behind anyone from his nation, and there is no need to analyze the chain of narrators of the tradition.

Put simply, neither the tradition regarding Abu Bakr nor that of Abdul Rahman b. Auf leading the prayers with Prophet (s.a.w.a.) praying behind him (God forbid) is a proof of successorship for either of them. Simply because the Ahle Tasannun consider the two traditions 'reliable' and the chain of narrators as 'complete' does not make their successorship a reality.

Abu Bakr does not have any right or authority over other Muslims in his claim to lead the nation any more than Abdul Rahman b. Auf or even Ibne Umm Maktoom. As we have seen even Ibne Taymiyyah accepts this fact.